

## MINUTES - WORKFORCE COMMITTEE

<b>Date:</b>	Wednesday 29 May 2019	<b>Time:</b>	11:00 – 13:00
<b>Venue:</b>	Conference Room, Field House, BRI	<b>Chair:</b>	Selina Ullah, Non-Executive Director

<b>Present:</b>	<p><b>Non-Executive Directors:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms Selina Ullah, Non-Executive Director (SU)</li> <li>- Mr Jon Prashar, Non-Executive Director (JP) – dialled into the meeting</li> <li>- Mr Amjad Pervez, Non-Executive Director (AM)</li> </ul> <p><b>Executive Directors:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms Pat Campbell, Director of Human Resources (PC)</li> <li>- Ms Karen Dawber, Chief Nurse (KD)</li> </ul>
<b>In Attendance:</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms Lorraine Cameron, Head of Equality &amp; Diversity (LC) –W.5.19.7</li> <li>- Dr Ray Smith, Deputy Chief Medical Officer (RS) - W.5.19.9 (representing Dr Bryan Gill)</li> <li>- Ms Jacqui Maurice, Head of Corporate Governance (JM)</li> </ul>

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
W.5.19.1	<p><b>Apologies for Absence</b></p> <p>Dr Bryan Gill, Chief Medical Officer (BG)</p>	
W.5.19.2	<p><b>Declarations of Interest</b></p> <p>There were no interests declared.</p>	
W.5.19.3	<p><b>Unconfirmed Minutes of the meeting held on 24 April 2019</b></p> <p>The minutes were accepted as a correct record.</p>	
W.5.19.4	<p><b>Matters Arising</b></p> <p>The Committee confirmed that the actions identified as completed on the action log were now closed. The following updates with regard to the open actions were noted.</p> <p><b>W.2.19.9 – Workforce Report/Workforce Dashboard:</b> Updates have been made to the dashboard but information was still awaited from the wider IT review that was happening. The Committee agreed to extend the timescale for updates to the end July 2019</p> <p><b>W.1.19.17 – Development Session – Education Department:</b> Visit scheduled for 27 November 2019. <u>Action concluded</u></p> <p><b>W.3.19.16 – Items for Corporate Communication – Appraisals:</b> PC confirmed that every fortnight an article is included in Let's Talk focusing on staff appraisals and regular meetings with staff under the Let's Talk banner are held. KD suggested that a quarterly powerpoint presentation/report is produced which details the themes from Let's Talk Live and other staff events through the Trust. A board development session has been arranged to discuss the Communications Strategy. PC confirmed that a 'We are Bradford one year on' session is due to take place.</p>	

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
	<p><b>W.3.19.17 – Committee Review:</b> It was noted that the update to the Committee will be provided in June 2019.</p> <p><b>W.1.19.11 – Nurse Staffing Data – Maternity Services and metrics:</b> KD confirmed that this item would be covered as an action at the Quality Committee and can be closed on the Workforce action log. <u>Action closed</u></p>	KD
W.5.19.4.1	<p><b>Matters Arising from the Board of Directors</b> SU advised of an action for all Board Committees from the open Board meeting held on 9 May which was to discuss ‘Strategic Objective 4: to be a continually learning organisation’. The Committee noted that this will be added to the Committee agenda for June when feedback from the Quality Committee will be available to provide the context for the discussion to be held. The Committee also noted that a Board Development session will be scheduled to explore the profile of all strategic objectives later in the year.</p>	
W.5.19.4.2	<p><b>Matters Escalated from the Sub Committee</b> There were no matters escalated.</p>	
W.5.19.5	<p><b>Strategic Risks relevant to the Committee</b> SU drew attention to the risks specific to this Committee as highlighted within the document and all agreed to remain sighted on the risks during discussions.</p> <p>The Committee noted that significant progress has been made across the indicators with some concerns remaining around vacancies and short term sickness levels. They were reasonably assured and noted that the risk appetite which changed to ‘seeking’ had been approved by board.</p> <p>PC reminded the Committee that it had previously agreed at the previous meeting to reduce the number of KPIs linked to the BAF. It was agreed to have five KPI’s that linked to the five strategic aims of the People Strategy. The amendments suggested were agreed.</p>	
W.5.19.6	<p><b>Workforce Committee Dashboard</b> The Committee discussed the dashboard in detail. The following key themes were noted:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><u>Appraisal Rates:</u> Planning will be underway for the appraisal season and ensuring overdue appraisals up to the end of March 2019 have been carried out, escalating where necessary. The Workforce Committee in June will be provided with assurance on progress to ensure that all staff received an appraisal in the last 12 months. The next report on appraisals will then be in September when the appraisal season is open between 1<sup>st</sup> September and 31<sup>st</sup> December.</li> </ul> <p>SU was concerned about the downward trend data for appraisals and PC re-iterated that April is in the new appraisal year so the expectation was that appraisals due from April onwards would be covered through the appraisal season September-December. AP queried if any assessments have been undertaken with staff on the appraisal process. PC said that the quality of appraisals is measured through the staff survey and also through the audit plan. She advised that the indicator</p>	

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
	<p>was much improved. KD confirmed that the appraisal process helps in identifying poor performance in staff and performance managing them through the process.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>Equality Indicators:</u> Updated metrics will be covered in more detail in the presentation at W.5.19.7. The Committee noted the improvement shown around senior leaders indicators.</li> <li>• <u>Staff Friends and Family:</u> Q4 results have shown an improved position therefore the RAG rating will need reviewing once the benchmarking information is available on the 30<sup>th</sup> May. PC agreed to review.</li> <li>• <u>Sickness:</u> Agreed at last month's meeting to work to the 4.5% target going forward. Month on month reduction in long term sickness but short term sickness rates remain above target.</li> <li>• <u>Nursing fill rates:</u> Rates have remained relatively stable.</li> <li>• <u>Agency and turnover:</u> The agency use is continuing to reduce month on month and turnover is stable at Trust level.</li> <li>• <u>New Starter Training:</u> This has remained on target.</li> </ul> <p>SU referred to the positive picture presented and asked the Committee to note the good performance against targets.</p>	PC
W.5.19.7	<p><b>Equality &amp; Diversity Update presentation</b></p> <p>PC introduced the session and welcomed LC to the meeting.</p> <p>LC provided an annual update on the Workforce Disability Equality Standard (WDES) and drew attention to the key principles and metrics throughout the presentation. She also focussed on the actions put in place for staff with long term health conditions or disability. Equality &amp; Diversity sessions for staff with disability issues have been established. 99 staff expressed an interest in taking part with 45 staff in total attending the two sessions. The action plan will be completed and communicated once the results have been discussed with the staff networks through the Workforce Diversity Workstream in the next couple of weeks.</p> <p>LC gave the annual update on the Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES) and drew attention to the statistics on the improvements shown on recruitment in BAME posts particularly with Band 8 staff. SU and AP suggested that they would be happy to mentor someone in the Trust and LC advised that there is reciprocal mentoring included in the plan. Committee also noted the 18 volunteer BAME staff at band 8 or above that sit on all interview panels for posts at that level to provide independent scrutiny.</p> <p>Disciplinary rates were also discussed for BAME staff within the Core Departments. The HR department will be prioritising a review to determine why there is a disparity.</p> <p>The overall workforce is still ahead of trajectory and the Committee noted the progress made to reduce the gap on band 8+ recruitment by 10% over</p>	

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
	<p>the next 4 years.</p> <p>The Committee also noted the good progress made on 5 of the 8 equality objectives and the focus for the next report to the Committee will be a review of the Trust's performance and proposals for refreshed equality objectives from 2020-2024.</p> <p>An equality plan has been produced which has been circulated to wards and departments so that there is clarity re our plans.</p> <p>SU and all Committee members expressed their thanks to LC for the insightful presentation.</p>	
<b>W.5.19.8</b>	<p><b>Workforce Report</b></p> <p>PC presented the paper and highlighted a number of key points:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>Nursing vacancy position</u> – Despite there still being hotspot areas the Committee should note there were 94 less vacancies this year compared to last years data.</li> <li>• <u>Consultant recruitment</u> – This was showing a positive picture overall. Work is ongoing in Vascular Surgery, Microbiology/ Infectious Disease and Medical Oncology to mitigate the shortfalls in these areas.</li> <li>• <u>Apprenticeships</u> – Over 270 staff undertaking an apprenticeship programmes across a whole range of standards. Continuing to gain momentum and retention was improving.</li> </ul> <p>The Committee noted the paper.</p>	
<b>W.5.19.9</b>	<p><b>Guardian of Safe Working Hours</b></p> <p>RS asked the Committee to note the content of the quarterly report and highlighted that in the first quarter of this year the number of exception reports submitted had reduced to 44. The majority of the exception reports were relating to Junior Doctors working extra hours which have been paid as additional hours worked.</p> <p>The Committee noted the report</p>	
<b>W.5.19.10</b>	<p><b>Freedom to Speak Up Annual Report</b></p> <p>KD presented the paper and drew attention to the following two key points:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>FTSU concerns raised at BTHFT in 2018-19 Quarter 4</u> – There has been a spike in anonymous concerns in the A&amp;E department. This prompted targetted work in the department including weekly 'Let's Talk' meetings for staff with members of the Executive team, FTSU 'Drop In' sessions and focussed pieces of work led by the Transformation and Organisational Development teams around communication and team building. Advice was sought from the National Guardian Office to ensure the issues were being addressed appropriately and fully. These issues have now been addressed within the department.</li> </ul>	

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><u>National Data</u> - Shows an increase in concerns raised around harassment and bullying.</li> </ul> <p>The Committee discussed and noted the report.</p>	
W.5.19.11	<p><b>Nurse Staffing Data Publication Reports – April 2019</b></p> <p>KD presented the paper and asked the Committee to note:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The fill rates for registered nurses on days and nights remain consistent.</li> <li>One staffing concern raised through Datix related to harm to a registered nurse as a result of staffing issues. There has been a full investigation carried out on the Ward and appropriate actions taken.</li> <li>Ward 3 had reported an increased level of harm with regard to Grade 3 pressure ulcers.</li> <li>KD proposed the following;               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>An adjustment to the heat map RAG ratings for areas with planned numbers of 1 or less staff. This proposal would be brought back to the Committee.</li> <li>Blue-rating of 'compliments &amp; complaints'.</li> <li>Blue-rating of 'falls with no harm' however, if there is harm then this would be red-rated. The Committee noted however that reporting of 'falls with no harm' in areas such as 'care of the elderly' is likely to be high due to staff mobilising patients on the ward.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>The Committee discussed the report and approved the changes proposed.</p>	
W.5.19.12	<p><b>Board Assurance Framework</b></p> <p>SU asked if the Committee was satisfied the necessary controls and mitigations were in place to cover the areas of concerns that have been highlighted and discussed at the meeting. The Committee felt confident that progress was being made across a range of key workforce indicators and that they had received evidence demonstrating tangible assurance.</p> <p>The Committee were concerned about the WDES metrics and the areas of the WRES around perceptions of inequality of opportunity and harassment &amp; bullying. The Committee aimed to achieve the target in 2025 and encouraged the implementation of a robust action plan.</p> <p>The Committee noted that since last year they had made significant progress in appraisal targets, improved nursing vacancy rates, improved the apprenticeship position and perception indicators on the staff survey. The Committee agreed to make a proposal to the Board of a green RAG rating in the highlight report.</p>	SU
W.5.19.13	<p><b>Confirmed minutes of the Education and Workforce Sub Committee – February 2019</b></p>	

No.	Agenda Item	ACTIONS
	The Committee accepted and noted the minutes from the meeting of the Education and Workforce Sub-Committee held on 15 <sup>th</sup> February 2019.	
<b>W.5.19.14</b>	<b>Any Other Business</b>  No other business was discussed	
<b>W.5.19.15</b>	<b>Matters to share with other Committees</b> There were no matters to share	
<b>W.5.19.16</b>	<b>Matters to Escalate to the Strategic Risk Register</b> There were no matters to escalate	
<b>W.5.19.17</b>	<b>Matters to Escalate to the Board of Directors</b> There were no matters to escalate	
<b>W.5.19.18</b>	<b>Items for Corporate Communications</b>	
<b>W.5.19.19</b>	<b>Agenda items for the Workforce Committee scheduled 26 June 2019</b>  The committee noted the agenda. Strategic Objective 4 to be added to the June agenda.  SU suggested inviting a local Trust to present on their friends and family data to a future Workforce Committee meeting. PC agreed to look into this.	SU     PC
<b>W.4.19.21</b>	<b>Date and time of next meeting</b> 26 June 11:00-12:30	



**BRADFORD TEACHING HOSPITALS NHS FOUNDATION TRUST**  
**ACTIONS FROM WORKFORCE COMMITTEE – May 2019**

Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
29.5.19	W.5.19.4	<b>Matters Arising</b> <b>W.1.19.11 – Nurse Staffing Data – Maternity Services and metrics</b> KD confirmed this item would be covered as an action at the Quality committee and can be closed on the Workforce action log.	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 26 June 2019	<u>Action closed</u>
29.5.19	W.5.19.6	<b>Workforce Committee Dashboard – Staff Friends and Family</b> RAG rating to be reviewed once benchmarking information is available on 30 <sup>th</sup> May	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 26 June 2019	Information being updated as part of the dashboard. <u>Action Closed</u>
27.03.19	W.3.19.17	<b>Committee Review</b> The following should be noted and form part of the review. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The necessity of having monthly meetings of the Workforce Committee</li> <li>- The disproportionate level of detail contained within papers for monthly meetings – given the level of update provided.</li> <li>- If meetings remain monthly - should consideration be given to holding one longer meeting, then one shorter meeting the following month?</li> <li>- Committee might also like to consider holding quarterly transactional meetings and then have a 'subject-based' approach for additional monthly meetings.</li> <li>- Committee would benefit from wider membership. It would be beneficial for deputies to attend and present particular items</li> </ul>	Head of Corporate Governance	Workforce Committee 26 June 2019	New Chair in post early May. <u>Update to Committee 29 May 2019</u> : Date for all Board Committee Reviews being considered by the Chair and Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs. Committee to note that further update will be provided to Workforce Committee in June 2019.



Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
		These points would be shared with the Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs and the BTHFT Chair to support the review when it takes place.			
30.01.19	W.1.19.7	<b>Workforce Committee Annual Work Programme: Guardian of Safe Working Hours.</b> Andy Brennan, Associate Postgraduate Dean, to be invited to deliver a Board of Directors Development Session on 'Guardian of Safe Working Hours' at a time to be agreed during the next 6 months.	Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs	Workforce Committee 26 June 2019.	To be presented to the Board of Directors at meeting scheduled for 7 March 2019. Added to the June Board Development Session schedule. <u>Action closed</u>
29.5.19	W.5.19.12	<b>Board Assurance Framework</b> The Committee agreed to make a proposal to the Board of a green RAG rating in the highlight report.	Workforce Committee Chair	Board of Directors 11 July 2019	
24.04.19	W.4.19.14	<b>BAF: Proposed Board Development Session</b> A discussion took place regarding Communications and the role it could better play in supporting the celebration of the culture of the organisation. AP stated that it was essential to ensure that every piece of work is aligned back to the Trust's vision and strategic objectives. SU suggested it might be useful to explore the delivery of a Board development session with regard to the communications strategy.	Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs	Board of Directors 11 July 2019	
29.5.19	W.5.19.19	<b>Agenda items for 26 June 2019 meeting</b> Strategic Objective 4 to be added to the June agenda for discussion	Workforce Committee Chair	Workforce Committee 24 July 2019	Item deferred from May to June Quality Committee therefore discussion at Workforce Committee deferred to July. Added to July agenda.
27.02.19	W.2.19.9	<b>Workforce Report - Workforce Dashboard</b> to reflect any changes in the metrics and measures and align with the BAF from April 2019.	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 24 July 2019	29.5.19 – Committee agreed to change the timescale to July due to updates awaited from IT on dashboards.



Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
30.01.19	W.1.19.13	<b>Update on Seven Day Service Performance against Clinical Standards for 2018</b> BG stated that following the completion of the audit a report will be provided to the Committee.	Chief Medical Officer	Workforce Committee 24 July 2019	
29.5.19	W.5.19.19	<b>Agenda items for Workforce</b> SU suggested inviting a local Trust to present on their friends and family data at a future Workforce Committee. PC agreed to look into this	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	
30.01.19	W.1.19.7	<b>Workforce Committee Annual Work Programme: Development Sessions</b> BG agreed to bring a presentation on next year's Clinical Excellence Awards (CEAs) to the Workforce Committee meeting in September 2019.	Chief Medical Officer	Workforce Committee 25 September 2019	